Blended Learning Instruction in English for Specific Purposes: An Ethnographic Investigation of Project-Based Learning

Susanto* ID

State Islamic University Sayyid Ali Rahmatullah Tulungagung (UIN SATU), Indonesia
Email: damarsusanto53@yahoo.co.id

Abstract

Although many studies have scrutinized the adoption of project-based learning (PBL) in various EFL/ESL teaching contexts, the implementation of PBL under the blended learning instruction in English as specific purposes (ESP) field is relatively less reported. Especially in the Indonesian ESP context, where ESP courses are taught mainly by English teachers from non-ESP backgrounds. To fill this lacuna, the present study adopted an ethnographic approach and endeavored to investigate the integration, fulfilment, practice, and challenge of applying PBL into blended ESP learning instructions. Notably, this research describes how the PBL is integrated with the one-year blended ESP course, how it helps learners improve their specific English and disciplinary knowledge, and the perceived challenges of PBL pedagogy in the PUA. The findings indicated that PBL in blended ESP instruction was implemented in two common ways: PBL as a significant source of assessments mini-research and classroom activities. Furthermore, students' specific English, disciplinary knowledge, mini-research concepts, teamwork, and critical thinking were enhanced through PBL experiences in blended ESP instructions. Meanwhile, ESP teachers' lack of disciplinary knowledge and mutual collaborations between language and disciplinary teachers became significant challenges in attaining harmony. The unique PBL blended ESP instructions serve pedagogical implications for other ESP teachers. Future researchers are suggested to explore the effectiveness of collaborative teaching involving language teachers and disciplinary teachers within the same ESP context.

Introduction

English for specific purposes (ESP), which has two branches of English for academic purposes (EAP) and English for occupational purposes (EOP), has been widely adopted by many universities to equip and prepare their undergraduate students with disciplinary English academic needs and occupational features to prepare them to be internationally qualified and competitive. In the global context, many universities in China, Romania, Iran, Saudi Arabia, Indonesia, Australia, Malaysia, and Singapore have included ESP/EAP programs to enhance and support their academic qualities and reputation (Al-Omairi, 2020; Alavi, Borzabadi, & Dashtestani, 2016; Arifani, Hidayat, Mulyadi, & Wardhono, 2020; Atay & Ozbulgan, 2007; Dashtestani, 2020; García-Sánchez, 2016; Li & Wang, 2018). Because of these phenomena, researchers

---

around the globe endeavor to enhance the quality of ESP/EAP practices through different types of research focuses and designs. Many successful endeavors and outcomes of the quality improvement have been publicized, such as ESP/EAP vocabulary enhancements (Akbari & Tahririan, 2009; Arifani, Mindari, Hidayat, & Wicaksono, 2021; Atay & Ozbulgan, 2007; Shaalan, 2020), online/blended EAP/ESP and teacher element (Dashtestani, 2020; Mulyadi, Arifani, Wijayantingsih, & Budiastuti, 2020; Xu, Chan, & Yilin, 2020); traditional ESP teaching (Li & Wang, 2018), learners' interactions (García-Sánchez, 2016).

The positive results and the transfers of knowledge from previous studies seem excellent because the study participants and research contexts did not have any significant issues regarding ESP/EAP teachers' academic English qualities and academic disciplinary. In Shanghai, for example, Li and Wang (2018) investigated two EAP teachers' practices of PBL in the EAP context where two teachers were qualified in both specific academic and disciplinary. Their specific academic records could facilitate EAP teaching and learning since they have relevant educational PhD background to the EAP course they taught. Meanwhile, Mulyadi et al. (2020) just investigated the effectiveness of blended ESP instruction from learners' perspectives.

In the Indonesian ESP context, the conditions are very different. Most of the ESP teachers have a non-linear/relevant education background to the ESP course they taught. Therefore, the outstanding knowledge transfer from the previous studies cannot be applied to the Indonesian ESP context. Also, it seems necessary to give practical and theoretical contributions in the 'non-linear' condition of ESP teachers. Therefore, this study aims to implement PBL in blended learning instruction in the Indonesian ESP setting.

Research context

This research study is based on a private university coded as "Private University-A" (PUA) in Indonesia. This university belongs to the first-tier category of private universities located in East Java province, and specializes in English education, medical, economics and business as most popular majors for Indonesian students. PUA has an international reputation, outlook, and an enrolment of many international students. PUA is very well-known and becomes the priority of Indonesian students. PUA has also collaborated with some overseas universities in the USA and European countries as parts of the joint university programs. All the ESP textbooks are written in English. All ESP courses at the non-English primary students are taught using English. The students at PUA have opportunities to study abroad. All of these supports have contributed to the possibility of enrolling in the ESP course in the PUA.

In this university, all non-English primary students must study a compulsory ESP course in their first academic year for two consecutive semesters. As part of the ESP curriculum, TOEFL iBT tests are administered at the beginning and the end of the semester program before they obtain their ESP certificate from the University Language Centre. The selected students from the same majors are classified and grouped in the same ESP class based on their iBT scores. The students who achieve a score of 80 or above belong to the same class, and each class consists of 40-50 students (Mulyadi et al., 2020). When this ethnographic study started, the ESP students were in their first and second semester in their first year of study. The first experiment of project-based learning (PBL) blended ESP instructions were implemented in September 2020.

The Association of Indonesian ESP Teachers has developed ESP course books in collaboration with content teachers. This forum has had regular academic activities to discuss the ESP curriculum, books, research on ESP fields, seminars and other ESP issues. The course books contain a specific purpose, such as English for economics and business, designed for integrated listening, speaking, reading, and writing in a specific disciplinary area such as international marketing, making a business plan, selling products, and customer satisfaction. The books are designed for intermediate levels of English. Therefore, all ESP book contents are modified into intermediate to advanced levels by the university team. The ESP teachers also supply relevant leaflets, articles, and books from specific disciplinary sources to help their ESP students learn specific English purposes from integrated listening, speaking, reading and writing skills. The PBL is integrated as a part of primary activities, tasks, assessments for the ESP students during each academic year through blended instruction approaches.

Literature review and theoretical framework

PBL in ESP: Opportunities and limitations

The phrase project-based learning (PBL) is similar to problem-based learning. In the PBL paradigm, project activities involve complex instructional conceptions. PBL provides ESL/EFL learners with a situated environment, enabling them to address and respond to issues from the specific project completion. Krauss and Boss (2013) stated that PBL assigns the ESL/ESL students a cycle of projects: "In project-based learning (PBL), students are likely to read, research, work in a team, consult to experts, use a variety of technologies, write, create media, and speak publicly in the process of learning cycle". Meanwhile, in a problem-based learning context, the students are expected to produce a fixed answer from the learning

activity. It is designed to help learners' ability in solving a problem in a specific discipline. Wood and Head (2004) provide a clear example of problem-based learning in the EAP medical course in the EAP context. The students are free to diagnose and identify the patients using their ways. The methodological processes of problem-based learning are relatively shorter than project-based learning.

The benefits of project-based learning have been acknowledged by educational researchers (Duke, Halvorsen, Strachan, Kim, & Konstantopoulos, 2021; Guo, Saab, Post, & Admiraal, 2020; Li & Wang, 2018; Poonpon, 2017; Shekarian & Parast, 2021; Tsybulsky, Gatenio-Kalush, Abu Ganem, & Grobgeld, 2020; Wu & Wu, 2020). Beckett and Miller (2006) conducted a longitudinal study to examine ESL students' perceptions and reactions and implement project-based learning in a public school in Vancouver, Canada. The results indicated that PBL provided fruitful meaning construction for their ESL learners. This PBL research was conducted in an ESL setting, not in ESP or EAP, where English was used for specific and academic purposes. Shekarian and Parast (2021) echoed similar results. In their study, PBL could enhance learners' entrepreneurship skills. It also implied that the PBL could enhance students' specific disciplinary knowledge. Next, another study by Duke et al. (2021) and Tsybulsky et al. (2020) stated that PBL could improve students' motivation and social interaction in the ESL context and teacher education. The benefits of PBL have been positively impacted on students', preservice teachers, and teachers' competencies. However, PBL was conducted within blended ESP instruction where the ESP teachers had no linear disciplinary knowledge, and they had low experience from their education.

Theoretical Framework of PBL and Blended learning instruction in ESP

Two potential theoretical frameworks underlying PBL and Blended Learning (BL) in ESP fields are elaborated in this part. First, PBL provides opportunities for adequate classroom instructions since it offers student-centered language input, exposures, and output opportunities using multisensory and multimodal learning experiences (Beckett & Miller, 2006). In this case, PBL provides ESP learners with situated learning experiences through project completion. Several experts have recognized other benefits of project-based learning. PBL provides language socialization, disciplinary expertise (Duke et al., 2021; Li & Wang, 2018; Poonpon, 2017; Shekarian & Parast, 2021). For example, Li and Wang (2018) have confirmed the importance of PBL under the transition of English for general purposes into English for academic purposes (EAP), where the students have authentic experiences in their academic socialization. Next, in the same EAP context, Wingate (2015) asserted similar benefits of implementing PBL into their EAP classes. The students experience specific discourse from the immersion and interaction with relevant experts in a particular academic discipline through PBL.

Second, the theoretical framework for implementing blended learning is based on the inherent benefits of face-to-face and online interactions between learner-learner and teacher-learner during teaching and learning activities. Regarding these conceptions, Osguthorpe and Graham (2003) describe the objective of blended learning as teaching and learning strategies that aim to find a learning harmony from online access and face-to-face interaction. Therefore, the theoretical underpinning for this study relies on the enhancement of learners' project works through online access and face-to-face interaction from peers, environment, tasks, and ESP teachers. Although blended learning has been widely investigated and positive and negative findings have been reported in ESL/EFL pedagogy (Arifani et al., 2021; García-Sánchez, 2016; Kocoglu, Ozek, & Kesli, 2011; Mulyadi et al., 2020), it has been relatively sparse regarding blended learning research in ESP course implementing PBL.

The context of PBL in EAP in the above previous studies was different from the ESP in the Indonesian context. Li and Wang (2018), for example, involved two specific PhD teachers from linear/specific academic disciplines and found no further issues with teachers' disciplinary knowledge within the EAP course and their language expertise. Meanwhile, in Indonesian ESP context, it is very different because the ESP teachers have no specific English disciplinary knowledge. Most of them are graduated from English language education with limited or no experience in ESP teaching and learning.

However, there is limited well-documented research justifying the implementation of PBL in problematic ESP teaching, such as in the PUA in Indonesia, sampled for the current study, where most of the ESP teachers are graduated from English and language teacher education with little or even no ESP education background. In this case, how the ESP teacher efforts to facilitate students' needs in their disciplinary knowledge and general specific needs has not been examined. They learn to understand the ESP teaching and learning during teaching practices at their workplace. This study aims to address the following questions:

1. How is PBL integrated into the blended ESP course in PUA?
2. How does PBL promote learners' specific English needs and disciplinary knowledge through blended ESP courses in PUA?
3. What are the perceived challenges of PBL pedagogy in the blended ESP learning instruction in the PUA?

These research questions were determined after having completed a review of the previous studied and carried out a long and extensive fieldwork.

Research Methodology

- *Research design*

This ethnography study aimed to explain the integration of PBL into the blended ESP course and the aspects of PBL in blended ESP instructions in the PUA. The research questions were developed followed Karen (2008) and Li and Wang (2018), the questions were not defined based on the hypothesis, but they were constructed during the fieldwork and during reading the literature review of PBL. This ethnographic study examined people's behaviors through prolonged cultural immersion, observation, and interaction (Wolcott, 2008). This research is part of a five-year PUA project that explores PBL as part of the blended ESP course programs.

- *Study Participants*

In selecting the sample, the author did not use any sampling procedures because ethnography is a naturalistic design that requires observations in the target culture from a group or community, and it cannot be forecast whom the researchers will encounter (Hammersley & Atkinson, 2019; Karen, 2008). Instead, as doing an ethnographic study is like an adventure, the researchers followed ethnographic story construction and development from the study participants proposed by Li and Wang (2018).

The research subjects of this ethnographic study were two senior ESP lecturers YA and BHW, who had been teaching the ESP course using blended approaches in the PUA for more than five years. The department permitted the researchers to observe YA and PSR classes. Each class had 50 students, and the students from those two classes came from the same years of study. YA's students were in the first semester students majoring in Economics (English for Management), and BHW's students were in the second semester majoring in nursing (English for Business). The department reported the two subjects as the initiators of the ESP program using PBL as well. The two ESP teachers' demographic data is included in Table 1.

Table 1. *The ESP teachers' demographic information*

Name	Gender	Age	Nationality	Position	Education	Participation in the study
YA	Male	44	Indonesian	Lecturer	PhD	Eight months
PSR	Female	36	Indonesian	Lecturer	PhD	Eight months

- *Data Collection and Analysis*

The researcher adopted several methods to collect the ethnographic data through combinations of online and offline approaches. They involved ethnographic interviews with the two ESP teachers, groups interview with the ESP students from the two different ESP classes, unstructured classroom observations, an analysis of ESP teachers' teaching materials, and participant observations. The fieldwork data collection procedures were conducted via online platforms, either synchronous or asynchronous platforms. The researcher stayed in the fields for eight months (two consecutive semesters), from September 2020 to December 2020 (the first semester) and March 2021 to June 2021 (the second semester). During the fieldwork, the researcher usually visited YA and PSR twice a week, and every visit lasted three hours. The interview processes during the ethnographic study were conducted in casual conversations, and the focus of the interview was on issues that took place in a particular space and time (Li & Wang, 2018; Maggs-Rapport, 2000; Ogden & Roulon, 2009). In addition, the researcher implemented 30 minutes to an hour unstructured interview during weekday lunch after the ESP class. The interviews aimed to draw ESP teachers' and students' experiences during their PBL blended ESP teaching and learning activities.

Online interviews were conducted through WhatsApp calls and messages. The participants answered the researcher's questions of PBL practices and challenges during blended ESP teaching and clarified PBL preparations, practices, challenges, and evaluations during the ESP teaching and learning. During the online interviews with the students using the Zoom application, the researcher also posted some questions in the chat bar to respond to the questions more reluctantly. In the following steps, the researcher built his initial understanding of PBL blended ESP classes through classroom observations to see the actual implementations of PBL in the blended ESP fields (Li & Wang, 2018; Robson, 2011) and students' expressions and reactions to their ESP class (Morrison, 1993). To minimize any obstructive effects during the ethnographic study, the researcher even asked the ESP teachers to inform their ESP students about the research activities and get their consent. The researcher did not introduce himself to students informally. At the initial stage of the fieldwork, the researcher attended their classes on time, and sat at the back row to avoid learners' obstructive behaviors. The ESP teacher also gave their course materials such as lesson plan, PPT slides, and some examples of tasks and their scoring rubrics.

In the following fieldworks stage, the researcher became close to the ESP teachers and students and was also invited to participate in tutoring the ESP students' group projects. During the researcher's involvement in tutoring students' group projects, he also conducted participant observations. This involvement indicated that the researcher was accepted and had emerged as a member of the PBL ESP community to reflect his ethnographic experiences from the insider's perspective.

Findings

Research Question 1 (RQ1): How is PBL integrated into the blended ESP course in PUA?

- *PBL implemented using traditional and online teamwork*

Teacher YA and PSR described how the PBL was integrated into the blended ESP course. They explained the mechanism of the PBL using blended ESP teaching instruction. The tasks were divided into two kinds, namely traditional PBL, where the ESP students were assigned to accomplish their traditional project in the first semester. Project accomplishment was done through face-to-face team discussion and presentation. In the following semester, the students were assigned to accomplish their online project works. The students were assigned to work, discuss, report, and present their projects via zoom presentation. The following excerpts illustrated the remarks from teachers YA and PSR.

Teacher YA : We applied PBL in blended formats to learn from different approaches: traditional and online projects that we had prepared in advance. In the first semester, we dealt with traditional project accomplishments. Meanwhile, in the second semester, we implemented online project activities. Moreover, we prepared our ESP students to learn not only specific English needs but also technological abilities. Therefore, we designed blended ESP teaching through our courses.

Teacher PSR : The projects were implemented into two stages, traditional projects during traditional ESP teaching and online tasks. In addition, online ESP teaching using both synchronous and asynchronous platforms was also applied. The project works were design based on the theory of project-based, and I understand the stages very well. For example, as I teach English of Business, I usually ask my students to read English for business, discuss how to start a business, write analysis results, and discuss them with relevant articles to develop their critical thinking and research skills.

The two teachers' remarks revealed how the PBL was implemented during the first and second semesters. PBL was applied to equip the ESP students with specific English abilities and teamwork, but it was also designed to support their technological skills. Although teacher PSR did not comprehensively understand the conception of PBL, she could mention the steps of project-based very well through her English for business course. The teacher PSR also tried to promote her learners' critical thinking to her project, and she could also train her students to connect between theory and practices to support their academic disciplinary knowledge. The researcher also identified several aspects of PBL experiences through the fieldwork which are described later in this study.

- *Traditional and online PBL completions as primary source assessment*

Teacher YA and PSR graded their ESP students based on students' daily activity and presence (15%), quizzes and tests (25%), project works activities and completions (60%). For example, in the first semester, quizzes were given twice during the whole semester in the YA's class. It was administered after five to six meetings. Meanwhile, in the project works, the students were divided into ten groups (four to five students in a group), who took a turn to present their projects, such as on the topics of "becoming a manager". This topic was designed for the first semester ESP management students. The students were asked to interview a manager from different business areas. They were also assigned to construct open-ended questions and interview protocols from relevant references. Teacher YA also stated that he had let his students become familiar with English for management, words, phrases, and sentences usage. Academic or research articles from reputable journals in the management fields could support his students to communicate in the real disciplinary context. Before the students did their project works in teams, teacher Y also taught his students English skills to communicate in their specific discipline. Speaking was also conducted in interactive ways such as role-play to be an interviewer and interviewee before going to the actual context. These activities were conducted using face-to-face and zoom or video calls and recorded for classroom discussion and presentation.

The project also prepared the students to learn reading activities from relevant articles and helped them design their interview protocols before the actual interview with a manager. YA gave his students two months to accomplish their fieldworks projects. The students could consult their teacher when they had a

problem with their project completions. During reporting the progress of their project works, the teacher gave notes and comments to ascertain the quality of their projects. He assessed the project contents, language, grammar, presentation, team works, and report. During the interview with a manager, they were allowed to use mixed English and Indonesian languages.

In the PSR class, she taught the second semester ESP students majoring in English for business. During the fieldwork, the tutor became a participant observer for the students' project works. She helped their students prepare for the accomplishment of the project. For example, one group was planning to write a project to promote a product and make the product marketable. This group worked with the author. The author gave guidance to his students to define and focus on the specific type of product and helped them produce specific questions. Under his guidance, the students could produce a good description of an innovative product from different target markets like quality, package, price, and promotion. The assessment of these projects was in the form of written reports. In the following project, the students were also required to do market interviews and analyses. The students had to interview a product seller or owner. They were required to record the interview process. The following week, they had to conduct group presentations and discussions during classroom teaching and learning sessions. One student reviewed a food product such as the taste, price, location, process to cook, and why the product was popular. From the uploaded video project, peers comment public assessments were also considered. Teacher PSR also prepared a rubric for assessing the quality of students' written reports, presentations, and videos. Students' peer ratings were 15%, reports and presentations were 35%, and PSR's grading was 50%.

Research Question 2 (RQ2): How does PBL promote learners' specific English needs and disciplinary knowledge through blended ESP courses in PUA?

- *Students' specific English and disciplinary promoted through the classroom.*

Teacher YA elaborated his classroom activities to promote students' specific English and disciplinary knowledge through PBL. Students listened to native English conversation, discussion, and news from relevant sources in their disciplinary area in listening class. For his English class, he provided a listening activity between two different managers and asked them to take notes, write vocabulary, give meaning, answer listening questions, make a summary, and make a role-play interview. In reading activities, the students were asked to read articles in the management field to strengthen their disciplinary knowledge. The extracts of the interview with YA were presented below:

Teacher YA   :   I teach my student integrated English skills in specific disciplines for the students. For example, in my listening class, I use various sources from video, TV news, and YouTube to learn specific English in the management field. I also ask my students to make a summary, answer some questions, and make a conversation based on the topic we have. Before doing the field works, I equip my students with specific English words because they have low English proficiency.

The above extract illustrates how teacher YA tried hard to facilitate his students with English for management and disciplinary knowledge. He taught integrated skills to facilitate his students with contextual learning. In addition, he brought relevant sources to the classroom to equip their students with specific English and disciplinary needs.

Teacher PSR also described her classroom activities to facilitate students' specific English needs and disciplinary knowledge. For example, through her English for business, she taught using a similar strategy as YA's. The following extract illustrates how she promoted her teaching disciplinary content and specific English.

Teacher PSR   :   Facilitating my students with integrated English skills is very useful for them to learn specific English for business and their disciplinary knowledge. In speaking class, I assign my students with small discussion activities like an actual business forum. One group presents its innovative products, and other groups give questions on the products' quality, price, innovation, and promotion. These activities make them familiar with business English terms, expressions, and experiences. In my writing class, I also ask my students to describe a product using English to strengthen their written communicative skills.

Like the first teacher, PSR also taught integrated English skills to support students' specific business English and discipline. She believed that English should be used for communicative purposes. Therefore, she often asked the students to write an essay, discuss a business topic in her class using English.

- *Mini-research project enhances students' disciplinary knowledge, English, critical thinking, and academic research experience.*

Teachers YA and PSR assigned mini-research projects to their students as parts of their project work. They gave indirect research experiences for their students through academic reading classes and project works. From their reading class, they asked their students to read some research articles relevant to their projects. The two teachers asked their students to produce an interview protocol or describe a product from the articles they read in the project works. The following extracts represent the implementation of the mini project:

Teacher YA   :   I ask my students to prepare and design their interview protocols by exploring some research papers. They have to read and review some relevant articles to produce a good framework of interview questions. When they read, they learn not only English for the interview but also develop critical thinking ability. It is not an easy task because the language from an article is complicated to understand. Therefore, teamwork needs to be carefully planned. Brilliant students have to be equally distributed in different teams.

Teacher PSR   :   In essay writing, I also ask my students to discuss what they write with relevant references. This activity is good to enhance their academic writing skill. Later, it can support their future research project.

The benefits of mini-research projects as part of the project work activities could enhance learners' specific English and disciplinary knowledge. Reading articles from reputable journals and reviewing them into interview protocol questions could enhance students' critical thinking and authentic experience of academic writing activities.

Research Question 3 (RQ3): What are the perceived challenges of PBL pedagogy in the blended ESP learning instruction in the PUA?

- *The ESP teachers' lack of content knowledge in the disciplinary areas*

Teacher YA and PSR reported that they faced a problem explaining content knowledge during the project works presentation and assessment sessions. They felt that they could not optimally give comments on students' projects, presentations, and tutoring because of their lack of content knowledge and experience in disciplinary areas. The author witnessed these challenges in various activities. Teachers YA and PSR, for example, in the classroom presentation, when the students presented their projects interview development for identifying the task of a manager from different fields and analyzing successful business, the two teachers' comments and notes relied much on students' language productions, grammar, and pronunciation. Therefore, they did not give comments on the content knowledge. It also witnessed students printed and online project works documents; the teachers mostly scored their projects based on the grammar of their written works, spelling, and formats.

- *Learners' low English proficiency*

Teacher YA and PSR reported that their students faced difficulties comprehending academic English from the journal articles because they had low vocabulary skills. The high standard of English published in the journal articles made them hard to understand the papers they read. The author also witnessed the students always translated unfamiliar words through their dictionary and wrote down the translation in Indonesian. Other students used google-translate tools and copied some paragraphs into the tools and read the translation results. In the classroom presentation, many students made pronunciation errors. Therefore, the two teachers often drilled the mispronounced words repeatedly to improve their pronunciation abilities. Teacher's pronunciation corrections were often witnessed during students' project presentations in the traditional or online classroom. YA and PSR complained about these issues, as seen in the following excerpts:

Teacher YA   :   It is hard to teach blended ESP courses because of students' proficiency issues. Most students in my class feel frustrated during classroom academic reading. They often ask me the meaning of unfamiliar words. That is why I ask them to bring their online dictionary during reading time in my class. In addition, I often correct their pronunciation, spelling, grammar during speaking and writing class.

Teacher PSR   :   I find myself unhappy when I encounter my students' pronunciation and writing errors. In reading students' online project reports, I work hard to correct their language problems, spelling, and grammar. However, unfortunately, their writing is terrible and hard to understand.

- *Low institutional support*

Teacher YA and PSR reported low collaborative support from their institution to optimize the harmony between English skills and disciplinary knowledge. Their collaboration was very limited in writing the ESP textbook design by the language teacher or of a particular discipline. During the PBL implementation, none of them was involved in the classroom teaching-learning process. Most teachers form different disciplines had low basic English as they felt unconfident to involve in the English classroom collaboration. Mutual collaboration between the ESP and discipline- specific teachers was suitable for learning English, but deficient support was given.

The researcher witnessed that all ESP textbooks were collaboratively written by one teacher from the specific discipline and 3 ESP teachers in every book. The researcher also witnessed evidence during the online meeting when teachers from each department of specific discipline and ESP reported these issues, and the department did not follow up. One of the reasons was excessive teaching hours for the teachers of these all disciplines and their low English proficiency. Their teaching schedules showed that one teacher taught 16 to 20 credit hours. Moreover, they also had to deal with overloaded administrative duties, thesis supervision, research, and community service as university demands. Therefore, the collaboration was not optimal.

Discussion

The present ethnographic study offered a glimpse of PBL implementation in blended ESP teaching and learning, which has rarely been examined. In this study, PBL was implemented in blended ESP instruction using two different ways: PBL was applied using traditional, team project works and a significant assessment source. This type of assessment was derived from different project work types with a more considerable percentage than the instant classroom tests could reflect students' English and disciplinary proficiency. Compared to other types of tests, such as multiple choices test, fill the gap test, and short answer tests formats, these project-work activities could assess students' English specific abilities and disciplinary knowledge at the same time. Students' communicative competence, English language, confidence, and critical thinking skill could be adequately seen and assessed during classroom presentations. Sawaki, Quinlan, and Lee (2013) stated that multiple-choice test formats could not describe students' fundamental competencies.

Furthermore, Li and Wang (2018) asserted similar findings. In their PBL research involving face-to-face EAP instruction, the results of their inquiry revealed that project works could provide actual context performance. Although it showed a similar result, this current finding offered novelty in the online and face-to-face project works at the same time. The online project works could serve as a reference for blended ESP instruction in a different setting.

PBL has also been implemented through mixed online and traditional-based PBL in ESP instruction in the present findings. The implementation of mixed online and traditional-based PBL could promote ESP students' teamwork, critical thinking, and English specific needs, disciplinary knowledge, and technological literacy. It is different from previous findings which they did not involve mixed-blended project works. Studies under the single mode of PBL could offer one side from this current finding (Duke et al., 2021; Poonpon, 2017; Shekarian & Parast, 2021). Since digital literacy is crucial for the students in the digital era, this study supports the students' technological skills by implementing project-based such as upload project videos, send files, modify and edit videos, and teleconference using the zoom platform. Thus, this study witnessed and supported the needs of technology for facing the digital environments.

Regarding the fulfilment of learners' English specific needs and disciplinary knowledge, this study found that teaching ESP using integrated skills reflected in the ESP textbook, additional resources, learning activities, and PBL could enhance learners' specific English skills and disciplinary knowledge (Li & Wang, 2018). For example, reading academic papers could promote students' English vocabulary, knowledge, and English skills. This activity also enhances their mini-research ability. The students could explore various information regarding their disciplinary knowledge and research experience to support their academic awareness of properly citing an article, writing references, and conducting direct and indirect quotations. Furthermore, teachers' efforts to comment and revise students' language errors, pronunciation, spelling could serve as practical exposures to enhance their English for a specific discipline. Meanwhile, reading from specific articles could enhance students specific disciplinary knowledge (Li & Wang, 2018).

The last discussion dealt with teachers' lack of disciplinary knowledge and ESP students' low English proficiency. Teachers' feedback during written and online reports and presentations relied on comprehensive language focus. It occurred because they had insufficient disciplinary knowledge. The harmony between English and disciplinary knowledge could not be achieved equally since the department and institution did not support mutual teaching collaboration between the ESP teachers and disciplinary teachers. This study also suggested mutual collaboration or team teaching between English language teachers and disciplinary teachers through different lesson study methods (Arifani et al., 2020; Arifani & Khaja, 2021). However, this team-teaching model proposed in this study has not been implemented in the Indonesian ESP context.

Conclusion

This eight-month long ethnographic study has explored the integration, practice, and challenges of PBL in blended ESP instruction in PUA, Indonesia. This study has proved that the implementation of PBL within the blended ESP instruction provides valuable insights in promoting ESP students' specific English needs and disciplinary knowledge in their specific fields. PBL also promotes students' teamwork, direct experiences, research, and critical thinking using the blended instructional approaches. However, significant challenges lied on the ESP teachers' disciplinary knowledge, minimum support from departments and institutions. The need for collaborative teaching practices in the ESP pedagogy was also echoed from this ethnographic study. It suggests that fruitful collaborative teaching involving the ESP teacher and disciplinary teacher are required to minimize the disharmony between the needs of specific English and disciplinary knowledge. Although this ethnographic study did not involve many participants, it could still shed light on the PBL practices in the ESP context. The author hopes that the developed ESP in the PUA teachers could serve as valuable references for the PBL practices in ESP with similar characteristics. Looking at the merits of collaborative teaching in non-ESP settings using various forms like lesson study and team teaching, the implementation of collaborative teaching in the ESP context could be an alternative for further researchers to examine these unique collaborations.

References

Akbari, Z., & Tahririan, M. (2009). Vocabulary learning strategies in an ESP context: The case of Para/medical English in Iran. *The Asian EFL Journal Quarterly, 11*(1), 39-61. Retrieved from https://asian-efl-journal.com/March_2009.pdf#page=39

Al-Omairi, M. (2020). The use of vocabulary learning strategies by EFL and EAP undergraduate university learners' in the Iraqi context. *Arab World English Journal (AWEJ) Special Issue on the English Language in Iraqi Context*, 111-120. doi: https://dx.doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.3533601

Alavi, S. M., Borzabadi, D., & Dashtestani, R. (2016). Computer Literacy in Learning Academic English: Iranian EAP Students' and Instructors' Attitudes and Perspectives. *Teaching English with Technology, 16*(4), 56-77. Retrieved from https://bibliotekanauki.pl/articles/955418

Arifani, Y., Hidayat, N., Mulyadi, D., & Wardhono, A. (2020). Enhancing EAP Learners' Vocabulary Acquisition: An Investigation of Individual SMS-Based Reporting Activities. *Teaching English with Technology, 20*(5), 125-146. Retrieved from https://yadda.icm.edu.pl/yadda/element/bwmeta1.element.desklight-a87dbed5-efef-4129-8558-85dbf6511fa4

Arifani, Y., & Khaja, F. N. M. (2021). Facebook Aided Lesson Study Design: Investigating Its Potentials on EFL Students' Literature Review Writing Skill. *International Journal of Instruction, 14*(1), 47-64. Retrieved from https://www.e-iji.net/dosyalar/iji_2021_1_4.pdf

Arifani, Y., Mindari, R., Hidayat, N., & Wicaksono, A. S. (2021). Basic psychological needs of in-service EFL teachers in blended professional training: voices of teachers and learners. *Interactive Learning Environments*, 1-14. doi: https://doi.org/10.1080/10494820.2021.1943691

Atay, D., & Ozbulgan, C. (2007). Memory strategy instruction, contextual learning and ESP vocabulary recall. *English for specific purposes, 26*(1), 39-51. doi: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.esp.2006.01.002

Beckett, G. H., & Miller, P. C. (2006). *Project-Based Second and Foreign Language Education: Past, Present, and Future (Research in Second Language Learning)*. IAP.

Dashtestani, R. (2020). Online English for Academic Purposes Instruction in the Context of Iran: Exploring the Instructor Element. *Teaching English with Technology, 20*(5), 23-37. Retrieved from https://yadda.icm.edu.pl/yadda/element/bwmeta1.element.desklight-f557ad7d-dbb6-4211-9307-1fa091f43998

Duke, N. K., Halvorsen, A.-L., Strachan, S. L., Kim, J., & Konstantopoulos, S. (2021). Putting PjBL to the test: The impact of project-based learning on second graders' social studies and literacy learning and motivation in low-SES school settings. *American Educational Research Journal, 58*(1), 160-200. doi: https://doi.org/10.3102/0002831220929638

García-Sánchez, S. (2016). Ubiquitous interaction for ESP distance and blended learners. *Journal of Applied Research in Higher Education, 8*(4), 489-503. doi: https://doi.org/10.1108/JARHE-04-2014-0052

Guo, P., Saab, N., Post, L. S., & Admiraal, W. (2020). A review of project-based learning in higher education: Student outcomes and measures. *International Journal of Educational Research, 102*, 101586. doi: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijer.2020.101586

Hammersley, M., & Atkinson, P. (2019). *Ethnography: Principles in Practice*. Routledge. doi: https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315146027

Karen, O. (2008). *Key concepts in ethnography*. Sage. Retrieved from https://uk.sagepub.com/en-gb/eur/key-concepts-in-ethnography/book229834

Kocoglu, Z., Ozek, Y., & Kesli, Y. (2011). Blended learning: Investigating its potential in an English language teacher training program. *Australasian Journal of Educational Technology, 27*(7). doi: https://doi.org/10.14742/ajet.908

Krauss, J., & Boss, S. (2013). *Thinking through project-based learning: Guiding deeper inquiry*. Corwin Press.

Li, Y., & Wang, L. (2018). An Ethnographic Exploration of Adopting Project-Based Learning in Teaching English for Academic Purposes. *Electronic Journal of Foreign Language Teaching, 15*(2), 290–303. Retrieved from https://e-flt.nus.edu.sg/wp-content/uploads/2020/09/li-1.pdf

Maggs-Rapport, F. (2000). Combining methodological approaches in research: ethnography and interpretive phenomenology. *Journal of advanced nursing, 31*(1), 219-225. doi: https://doi.org/10.1046/j.1365-2648.2000.01243.x

Morrison, K. R. B. (1993). *Planning and Accomplishing School-centred Evaluation*. Norfolk, VA: peter francis publishers.

Mulyadi, D., Arifani, Y., Wijayantingsih, T. D., & Budiastuti, R. E. (2020). Blended learning in English for specific purposes (ESP) instruction: Lecturers' perspectives. *Computer-Assisted Language Learning Electronic Journal, 21*(2), 204-219. Retrieved from http://callej.org/journal/21-2/Mulyadi-Arifani-Wijayantingsih-Budiastuti2020.pdf

Ogden, A., & Roulon, S. (2009). *From field projects in anthropology: A student handbook*. Illinois: Waveland Press Inc.

Osguthorpe, R. T., & Graham, C. R. (2003). Blended learning environments: Definitions and directions. *Quarterly review of distance education, 4*(3), 227-233. Retrieved from https://www.learntechlib.org/p/97576/

Poonpon, K. (2017). Enhancing English skills through project-based learning. *The English Teacher, 40*, 1-10. Retrieved from https://melta.org.my/journals/TET/downloads/tet40_01_01.pdf

Robson, C. (2011). *Real World Research*. John Wiley & Sons.

Sawaki, Y., Quinlan, T., & Lee, Y.-W. (2013). Understanding learner strengths and weaknesses: Assessing performance on an integrated writing task. *Language Assessment Quarterly, 10*(1), 73-95. doi: https://doi.org/10.1080/15434303.2011.633305

Shaalan, I. E.-N. A. W. (2020). Integrating Project-Based Learning Strategies in the Design of an ESP Dental Vocabulary Course for ESL Malaysian Majors. *Arab World English Journal, 11*(3), 464-483. doi: https://dx.doi.org/10.24093/awej/vol11no3.29

Shekarian, M., & Parast, M. (2021). Do Entrepreneurship Skills Improve Project Performance? A Project-Based Learning Perspective. *The Journal of Entrepreneurship, 30*(2), 267-305. doi: https://doi.org/10.1177/09713557211025653

Tsybulsky, D., Gatenio-Kalush, M., Abu Ganem, M., & Grobgeld, E. (2020). Experiences of preservice teachers exposed to project-based learning. *European Journal of Teacher Education, 43*(3), 368-383. doi: https://doi.org/10.1080/02619768.2019.1711052

Wingate, U. (2015). *Academic literacy and student diversity: The case for inclusive practice*. Multilingual Matters. doi: https://doi.org/10.21832/9781783093496

Wolcott, H. (2008). *Ethnography: A way of seeing* (2nd ed.). Walnut Creek, CA: Altamira Press.

Wood, A., & Head, M. (2004). 'Just what the doctor ordered': the application of problem-based learning to EAP. *English for Specific Purposes, 23*(1), 3-17. doi: https://doi.org/10.1016/S0889-4906(03)00031-0

Wu, T.-T., & Wu, Y.-T. (2020). Applying project-based learning and SCAMPER teaching strategies in engineering education to explore the influence of creativity on cognition, personal motivation, and personality traits. *Thinking Skills and Creativity, 35*, 100631. doi: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tsc.2020.100631

Xu, X., Chan, F. M., & Yilin, S. (2020). Personal learning environment: an experience with ESP teacher training. *Interactive Learning Environments, 28*(6), 779-794. doi: https://doi.org/10.1080/10494820.2018.1552872

Bio profile:

Susanto is a lecturer of English Language Education, Faculty of Education and Teacher Training Science, State Islamic Institute Sayyid Ali Rahmatullah Tulungagung (UIN SATU), East Java, Indonesia. He is currently the Head of English Language Education, Graduate Program of UIN SATU. He obtained his Doctoral Degree in English Language Education, from State University of Malang. His teaching interests are Research Methods in ELT and TEFL. He can be contacted at damarsusanto53@yahoo.co.id