

REVIEWERS REPORTS

Dear author(s),

Reviewers have given their comments on your paper.

Please do the following when you resubmit your revised version:

- (i) All corrections as per the reviewers' comments and prepare a table / response letter showing corrections done. Your corrections will not be accepted in the absence of this response letter / table.
- (ii) All authors' names, emails and affiliations checked and corrected
- (iii) Add ORCID IDs of all authors

Please ensure the submission of the revision within 15 days of receiving this mail only in the online system. Please do not send your revision by email. If your revision is found satisfactory, an acceptance letter will be issued for your manuscript. You will be required to pay the APC (that you have agreed upon) within one week after receiving the acceptance letter.

Please be noted that at this stage you cannot withdraw the paper. In case you find it difficult to do the corrections, please write to the editor (editor@ejal.info) to take the assistance of the writing team at nominal cost.

Editorial Team

Reviewer 1

- The paper is too short (3500 words approx..) Please add data as suggested and make it 5000-6000 words
- References in Indonesian language are not acceptable. Please replace them with English references

Your paper entitled *The Effectiveness of the Grammar (Qawâ'id) and Translation (al-Tarjamah) Methods in Learning Arabic* should be rejected outrightly as it does not contribute to research. It is more a collection of ideas, statements, definitions and approaches about Grammar and Translation (GT) method as a language teaching method. There is no dearth of studies on GT method and its various dimensions and context, and the current study also does not make any contribution to this domain. However, we should try to make this paper reach some stage of acceptability by suggesting some changes, if the author is willing to revise this manuscript.

1. Revise the title to suggest what kind of inquiry it is and if not required, drop the term, 'effectiveness'. This term is used only once in the whole paper. You are discussing more about strategies and techniques. So you may say "Effective techniques and strategies of the Grammar and Translation Methods in Learning Arabic"
2. There are too many references of Islamic principles, the prophet, and Arabic words within parentheses. Why? Please remove all these words, statements and focus only on methods and strategies. If required, use the English equivalents of the Arabic/ Indonesian terms

In addition to the above observations, the following are a few other changes suggested by keeping in view the journal format and also the contents of the paper

3. Abstract : The abstract must give an equal weightage to purpose, methodology, findings and Implications for Research and Practice, recommendations, etc. Please revise and reorganize/ modify.
4. Introduction: should contain a brief background information about the topic Please check if you can add a statement about rationale, purpose and research objectives along with the eligibility criteria. You may also state that there exists a research/ literature gap. You may also create a separate literature review section.
5. Methodology: The journal format requires the method section to contain Research design, sampling, procedure, and analysis. Please present your data accordingly.
6. Results and Discussion: These are two separate sections.. Results section contains the outcomes which may be presented in tabular form. Discussion section must contain summary of main results and brief references to previous researches.
7. Conclusion, Recommendations and Implications. It must include a brief conclusion of the research completed, limitations, recommendations for future research and implications for research and practice.

Decision: Revision required

Reviewer 2

The author has touched upon a very common topic, that of Grammar-Translation method used for language teaching. However, the title uses two Arabic words which confuses the reader. The title must truly represent the research work presented in the text and as pertinently as possible. Besides, your introduction lacks the rationale and research objectives. There is no literature review section. It should contain a few empirical studies to support your objectives. Results and Discussion are two separate sections. Results section contains the outcomes of all tests/ experiments, surveys, interviews, etc. some of which may be presented in tabular form. Discussion section must contain summary of main results and brief references to previous researches which agree or disagree with your findings. Make Conclusion, Recommendations and Implications a separate section, to include a brief conclusion of the research completed, limitations, recommendations for future research and implications for research and practice.

Besides, there are language and grammar errors and typos. There are too many Arabic/ Indonesian term used. Please remove them if not necessary. References must also be in English. Please replace all Indonesian references.

Decision: Accepted after Revisions