

Review Form

Title of the Manuscript: Sounding Islam in Contemporary Indonesia

We have received comments from the reviewers as follow:

1. Review Comments

Compulsory revision comments

- Restructuring article to bring out arguments more clearly
- Re-focus argument, and not delve into a historical narration that is not of immediate relevance to the argument
- Consistently and thoroughly link narration and explanation back to argument showing how the argument is being developed throughout the paper
- Improve conceptualisation throughout the article; some concepts are presented at the beginning, then dropped for the remainder of the article, then returned to at the end. These need to be brought into the article.

Minor revision comments

The article needs some further proofreading and language editing

Optional/General comments

This article tackles an excellent and very important topic, namely the relationship between sound and. It is well-written, and tackles its topic with a significant breadth and depth. It starts quite

strong, but then delves into a narration that is not really well structured and that does not bring out its arguments very explicitly. The article needs a bit more clarity on the methodology it is adopting, on how it makes the argument it makes, and on the theoretical framing it draws on. What literature/scholarship is this article speaking to and where does its contribution lay? Why these particular choices? The article has a lot of potential and is very important, it just needs to spell out these things more explicitly.

Further, is the article situating this islamophobia with the historical and the local? Where does contemporary imperialism and the connected global fit? Where does modernity as the global and dominant power structure fit? The author might find the work of the modernity/(de)coloniality theorists useful to bring these out and further develop the article's theoretical bite. See Anne Rasmussen's work in particular. I would highly suggest the incorporation of this work into the article and would encourage the author to continue this strain of research and scholarship.

Editor/Author Correspondence

Edito DELETE

r Subject: [JIIS] Editor Decision

2022- Dr phil Syaifudin Zuhri:

10-25

05:56 PM

We have reached a decision regarding your submission to JOURNAL OF INDONESIAN ISLAM, "SOUND AND THE MAKING OF RELIGIOUS SENSATION The Transformation of Javanese Tembang".

Our decision is to: REVISION REQUIRED

This is reviewer's note about the manuscript:

Naskah ini dikembalikan ke penulis untuk ditambahkan pembahasan, jumlah kata perlu ditambah menjadi 8000-9000 kata. Kata kunci pilih ungkapan yang mengandung makna konsep bukan kata sifat.

Revisi kembali ke redaksi maksimal pada tanggal 04 Nopember 2022.

You can see the reviewer's notes on the manuscript that was attached in this email.

Abdullah Mahfudz Nazal State Islamic University (UIN) of Sunan Ampel Surabaya am.nazal@uinsby.ac.id

JOURNAL OF INDONESIAN ISLAM

http://jiis.uinsby.ac.id/index.php/jiis

e-mail: jiis@uinsby.ac.id

Edito DELETE

Subject: [JIIS] Editor Decision

2022- Dr phil Syaifudin Zuhri:

12-29

07:19 PM

We have reached a decision regarding your submission to JOURNAL OF INDONESIAN ISLAM, "SOUND AND THE MAKING OF RELIGIOUS SENSATION The Transformation of Javanese Tembang".

Our decision is to: ACCEPTED

Abdullah Mahfudz Nazal State Islamic University (UIN) of Sunan Ampel Surabaya am.nazal@uinsby.ac.id

JOURNAL OF INDONESIAN ISLAM

http://jiis.uinsby.ac.id/index.php/jiis e-mail: jiis@uinsby.ac.id