



## Submit Article for NAMIBIAN

---

Salamah Noorhidayati <salamah.noorhidayati@uinsatu.ac.id>

21 Desember 2022 13.47

Kepada: editorial.namibianstudies@gmail.com

Dear Editor  
Journal of Namibian Studies (NAMIBIAN)

We have read and used scientific articles published in NAMIBIAN.  
The performance of the NAMIBIAN was excellent, and the published article helped us conduct research and write scientific reports.

I am Salamah Noorhidayati, representing other authors from the Islamic State University of Sayyid Ali Rahmatullah, Tulungagung, Indonesia.

We have completed a scientific article entitled "**Challenging the Theory of Justice of All Companions: Elaboration of M. Syuhudi Ismail's Thought in the Book of Validity Methods of Hadith Sanad.**"

We hope this article can be published in the NAMIBIAN because exciting findings in the scientific report can become new treasures in science, especially social sciences.  
We are willing to go through the review process following NAMIBIAN standards.

Best Regards,

Salamah Noorhidayati  
Islamic State University of Sayyid Ali Rahmatullah, Tulungagung, Indonesia



**NAMIBIAN\_Article\_Salamah.doc**

841K

---

Warach Madhyamapurush <editorial.namibianstudies@gmail.com>

26 Desember 2022 18.21

Kepada: Salamah Noorhidayati <salamah.noorhidayati@uinsatu.ac.id>

Dear  
Salamah Noorhidayati et al.  
Islamic State University of Sayyid Ali Rahmatullah, Tulungagung, Indonesia.

The NAMIBIAN Editorial Board has received the team article. I appreciate the team's interest in NAMIBIAN.

The team article will be processed according to the publication standards at NAMIBIAN.  
I beg you to be patient while waiting for the notification from the NAMIBIAN Editorial Board.

Always check email because the correspondence is only via email.

Best Regards,

--

Warach Madhyamapurush  
Editorial Board NAMIBIAN

28 Desember 2022 09.04

**Salamah Noorhidayati** <salamah.noorhidayati@uinsatu.ac.id>  
Kepada: Warach Madhyamapurush <editorial.namibianstudies@gmail.com>

Dear Editor  
Journal of Namibian Studies (NAMIBIAN)

Thank you for your response.  
We are happy to wait for the next stage.

Salamah Noorhidayati  
Islamic State University of Sayyid Ali Rahmatullah, Tulungagung, Indonesia  
[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]

**Warach Madhyamapurush** <editorial.namibianstudies@gmail.com>  
Kepada: Salamah Noorhidayati <salamah.noorhidayati@uinsatu.ac.id>

11 Januari 2023 17.27

Dear

Salamah Noorhidayati et al.  
Islamic State University of Sayyid Ali Rahmatullah, Tulungagung, Indonesia

Thank you for submitting the manuscript to NAMIBIAN.

We have completed our evaluation, and the reviewers recommend reconsidering the manuscript following minor revisions. Please resubmit the revised manuscript by February 21<sup>st</sup>, 2023, or ask whether an alternate date would be acceptable. We invite you to send it back after addressing the comments below.

When revising the manuscript, consider carefully all issues mentioned in the reviewers' comments: outline every change made in response to their comments and provide suitable explanations for any remarks not addressed. Please also note that the revised submission may need to be re-reviewed.

To submit a revised manuscript, please log in as an author at this email, and navigate to the "Revision" folder. NAMIBIAN values team contribution, and I look forward to receiving the revised manuscript.

Editor and Reviewer comments:

Reviewer #1:

1. Clarify the research objective: The abstract must be clearer in conveying the research objective. For example, explicitly explain why it is important to understand M. Syuhudi Ismail's views on the justice of companions and its implications for the authenticity of hadith.
2. Wider literature review: The article would benefit from a more comprehensive literature review on previous perspectives regarding the justice of companions and its relationship to the authenticity of hadith. This will help readers understand the contextual background of M. Syuhudi Ismail's thinking.
3. Provide more detailed explanation of the research methodology: The abstract should include a more detailed explanation of the research methodology used to analyze M. Syuhudi Ismail's views. Briefly explain how the author applied the descriptive-analytical method and referred to the typology of hadith critics in the science of al-jarh wa al-ta'dil.
4. Use more specific keywords: The presented keywords are still too general. It is recommended to use more specific and representative keywords that reflect the research content, such as "*companion justice in hadith criticism*" or "*M. Syuhudi Ismail's perspective on hadith authenticity*."
5. Integrate research findings: The abstract should provide a concise overview of the findings from the analysis of M. Syuhudi Ismail's views. Briefly explain the unique contributions brought by this research in expanding our understanding of the justice of companions and its influence on the validity of hadith narrations.

I hope you can make improvements as soon as possible and send the revised article again via this email.

**Salamah Noorhidayati** <salamah.noorhidayati@uinsatu.ac.id>  
Kepada: Warach Madhyamapurush <editorial.namibianstudies@gmail.com>

Dear Editor  
Journal of Namibian Studies (NAMIBIAN)

Thank you for the Editorial Board response to NAMIBIAN.  
We have read the revised instructions from the Reviewers.  
We will immediately correct the article according to the reviewers.

Best Regards,

Salamah Noorhidayati  
Islamic State University of Sayyid Ali Rahmatullah, Tulungagung, Indonesia



## Revision Article for NAMIBIAN

4 pesan

**Salamah Noorhidayati** <salamah.noorhidayati@uinsatu.ac.id>  
Kepada: Warach Madhyamapurush <editorial.namibianstudies@gmail.com>

21 Februari 2023 18.35

Dear Editor  
Journal of Namibian Studies (NAMIBIAN)

Thank you for the patience of the NAMIBIAN Editorial Board. We were waiting for the revision of our article.

We have made improvements according to the reviewer's instructions. I will be happy if there are still points that need to be improved again in the article.  
The revised Article is Attached.

Best Regards,

Salamah Noorhidayati  
Islamic State University of Sayyid Ali Rahmatullah, Tulungagung, Indonesia

 **Revision1\_NAMIBIAN\_Article\_Salamah.doc**  
815K

**Warach Madhyamapurush** <editorial.namibianstudies@gmail.com>  
Kepada: Salamah Noorhidayati <salamah.noorhidayati@uinsatu.ac.id>

3 Maret 2023 16.23

Dear  
Salamah Noorhidayati et al.  
Islamic State University of Sayyid Ali Rahmatullah, Tulungagung, Indonesia

Thank you for the team's efforts to make improvements to the article.  
Based on the Reviewers' considerations, the article has, at some point, increased.  
However, the team has to improve on a few more points. Hopefully are willing to do it.

Please follow the following revision instructions:

#Reviewer 2:

1. Provide more specific examples: To enhance the clarity and depth of the analysis, consider incorporating specific examples from M. Syuhudi Ismail's works to illustrate his views on the justice of companions. This will help readers better understand the arguments presented.
2. Expand on the research implications: In the abstract, briefly discuss the potential implications of M. Syuhudi Ismail's perspectives on companion justice for contemporary hadith studies or the broader field of Islamic scholarship. This will highlight the significance and relevance of the research findings.
3. Consider the counterarguments: To strengthen the scholarly discourse, acknowledge and address potential counterarguments to M. Syuhudi Ismail's views. This will demonstrate a comprehensive analysis and provide a more balanced topic evaluation.
4. Discuss the research limitations: It would be beneficial to acknowledge any limitations or constraints encountered during the research process. This could involve factors such as limited access to primary sources or the scope of the analysis. Addressing these limitations will enhance the credibility and transparency of the research.
5. Provide recommendations for future research: Conclude the abstract by suggesting potential areas for further exploration or research related to M. Syuhudi Ismail's perspectives on the justice of companions. This will encourage scholarly engagement and inspire future studies in the field.

Articles that have been revised and please send them back via this email.

--

Warach Madhyamapurush

Editorial Board  
Journal of Namibian Studies (NAMIBIAN)

---

**Salamah Noorhidayati** <salamah.noorhidayati@uinsatu.ac.id>  
Kepada: Warach Madhyamapurush <editorial.namibianstudies@gmail.com>

15 Maret 2023 00.32

Dear Editor  
Journal of Namibian Studies (NAMIBIAN)

Thank you for your response. We will be happy to revise the article according to these instructions.

Salamah Noorhidayati  
Islamic State University of Sayyid Ali Rahmatullah, Tulungagung, Indonesia  
[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]

---

**Salamah Noorhidayati** <salamah.noorhidayati@uinsatu.ac.id>  
Kepada: Warach Madhyamapurush <editorial.namibianstudies@gmail.com>

24 April 2023 12.02

Dear Editor  
Journal of Namibian Studies (NAMIBIAN)

Thank you for the patience of the NAMIBIAN Editorial Board. We were waiting for the revision of our article.

We have made improvements according to the reviewer's two instructions. We will be happy if there are still points that need further improvement in the article.

The revised Article is Attached.

Best Regards,

Salamah Noorhidayati  
Islamic State University of Sayyid Ali Rahmatullah, Tulungagung, Indonesia

---

 **Revision2\_NAMIBIAN\_Article\_Salamah.doc**  
828K



Salamah Noorhidayati &lt;salamah.noorhidayati@uinsatu.ac.id&gt;

---

**ACCEPTANCE LETTER**

1 pesan

---

**Warach Madhyamapurush** <editorial.namibianstudies@gmail.com>  
Kepada: Salamah Noorhidayati <salamah.noorhidayati@uinsatu.ac.id>

1 Mei 2023 09.32

Dear Author(s)

**Salamah Noorhidayati & Eko Zulfikar**

Warm Greetings!

**ACCEPTANCE LETTER**

It's a great pleasure to inform you that, after the peer review process, the **"Challenging the Theory of Justice of All Companions: Elaboration of M. Syuhudi Ismail's Thought in the Book of Validity Methods of Hadith Sanad"** team article has been accepted for publication in the NAMIBIAN Regular Issue 2023. Please make a payment publication fee.

Thank you for submitting the paper to this journal. We hope to receive it in the future too.

--

Warach Madhyamapurush

Editorial Board  
Journal of Namibian Studies (NAMIBIAN)**LoA\_NAMIBIAN\_Salamah.pdf**

178K